

WASHINGTON TOWNSHIP HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Minutes for February 20, 2008

Present: Bill Beute, Dale Blum, Caryl Brackenridge, Keith Hayes, Paul Krylowski, and Eileen Stokes.

This regularly scheduled February meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission, having been advertised in the *Observer-Tribune* in January, 2008, and posted on the Municipal Building bulletin board, was called to order at 7:45 p.m.

Chairman Eileen Stokes announced that this regularly scheduled meeting would include a Public Hearing for the Zion Lutheran Church and was being recorded. She requested that any media representative identify himself or herself. No media was present. She ascertained that a quorum was present and stated that alternate Bill Beute was voting as Commissioner Barbara Rossi was not present. She explained that the application would be presented, the Commissioners would comment, and then the meeting would be open for comments from the public. She requested that anyone who might comment sign in on the sheet provided in the hallway.

Minutes

Paul Krylowski made a motion, seconded by Bill Beute and unanimously approved, to accept the January 16 minutes as written.

Public Hearing

Applicant: Zion Lutheran Church, German Valley Historic District, 11 Schooley's Mtn. Road, B33, L43

James Knox, a principal in the firm of Gebhardt & Kiefer, located in Clinton, NJ, introduced himself and presented an Affidavit of Proof of Service and Deposition of Attorney Knox, an Affidavit of Publication (*Observer Tribune*, 1/31/08) and return cards proving notifications. He stated that those likely to speak would be Architect Richard Carroll, Reverend Peter Froehlke, Bill Keane and Barbara Schulz.

Attorney Knox presented the COA application and quoted the first paragraph of the Scope of Work which is dated February 1, 2008, and begins, "Zion Lutheran Church is proposing to build a one and two story, 6,747 gross sq. ft. addition to the existing Parish Center located at 11 Schooley's Mountain Road, Long Valley, Morris County, New Jersey (Block 33, Lot 43)....."

He then stated that the denial of the church's first application had aesthetic ramifications and financial ramifications as the church had to scrap those plans, hire a new architect and start from square one. He said that the application involves a conflict between the rights of the community to pursue religion and the rights of the community to pursue historic preservation.

The next speaker was **Reverend Peter Froehlke** of 17 Overlook Drive in Long Valley. Pastor Froehlke said that he was excited about Plan B as it would meet the needs of the church and still retain the existing Parish Center.

He talked about the contributions of this church, located in the heart of the community and open to its needs. Examples given were permitting the use of the parking lot for various community functions, hosting the Christmas Tree Lighting, serving lunch for the Historical Society House Tour, providing facilities for a Boy Scout and a Cub Scout troop, and housing the forty year old Long Valley Christian Nursery which has enrolled 3,000 children over the last fifteen years.

Pastor Froehlke stated that 2010 will be the church's 250th anniversary and the addition is essential for its ministry. There is not enough space currently for the high school students who need the church to protect them. Field Hall was built in 1938, the education wing in 1967 and they are not adequate for the current needs of the Sunday School and the social needs of the congregation.

In his opinion, if the application for a COA was denied, the church would become a museum, not a living, breathing part of the community.

Architect Richard Carroll of McAuliffe & Carroll of Lambertville, NJ, was introduced by Jim Knox. He stated that he had graduated from Temple University in 1990, attained national and NJ AIA status in 1993, was a member of the U.S. Green Building Council, and had begun his own practice in 1993/1994.

He discussed how the proposed plan satisfied the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and pointed out that he had met with the HPC in October to discuss the previous application and again in November for an informal presentation of conceptual ideas. He stated that the site poses severe restraints on a floor plan because of flood plains, stream buffers, etc.

Richard Carroll then introduced **Exhibit A1** to demonstrate the context of the site. The exhibit included a map and photos of properties on Schooley's Mtn Road and over the bridge. He explained that architecture doesn't happen in a vacuum but has to be tied to its setting. He said that the district's listing on the National and State Registers of Historic Places has to be considered so the past has validity in the design of modern buildings without attempting to recreate historic buildings. He said the previous design tried to compete with the church while this design tries to work with the church while respecting the context which exists in the town.

Exhibit A2 showed the floor plan of the project which is built as close to the restricting boundary lines as possible. He said that the previous plan would have demolished the Bartley Homestead, but retaining it allows the architect to hide the mass of the new building. He also stated that the new building does not dominate either the church or the house.

Exhibit A3 depicted the south, east, north and west elevations of the project. Mr. Carroll pointed out the consistent vernacular of Schooley's Mountain Road with a rhythm set by a series of gable-ended Victorian homes.

The application is for a COA for an institutional, public building which necessitates modern materials to satisfy low maintenance and safety concerns, and a design to house the mechanical systems. The roof of the two story wing will be lower than the Bartley House roof to minimize its size. Mr. Carroll then explained the various elevations and the visibility of each from the public thoroughfare.

The materials will be wood siding, cement plaster stucco and stone. Cost considerations may dictate changes, such as "cultured stone" rather than natural stone. He discussed the fenestration on various elevations. The gabled roofs will have fiberglass shingles, copper flashing, gutters and downspouts. The stucco will be cement based to blend in with the church. The main entryway will be a two-story atrium with aluminum clad windows and doors and will not be visible from the road. There will be a patio in the front with a stone veneered wall with an integrated planter box to help reduce the scale of the east elevation.

Exhibit A4 depicted the east elevations of the church, a portion of the addition and the Bartley House. This will be the view from Fairview Avenue as the major part of the new construction will be set back from the street.

Exhibit A5 showed an aerial perspective of each elevation.

Richard Carroll then discussed how the project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, satisfies the objections HPC had to the previous plan, meets the needs of the church congregation and the requirements for historic preservation.

Jim Knox stated that this plan is a big change from the previous plan and addresses the HPC concerns and meets the church's needs.

HPC Comments

Paul Krylowski stated that the plan was not what he expected from the November conceptual meeting, and he didn't see a relationship between the house and the new buildings and would like to see a new design.

Mr. Carroll responded that this is a building of its own time and shouldn't copy the details of either the house or the church. He said he felt that the design answered the previous HPC objections. He also stated that the details of the house would disappear and there would be "one big thing of oneness" if the new building mimicked the house. He repeated that the design met all the Standards for Rehabilitation.

Paul Krylowski disagreed. He stated that the details of the proposed new building do not fit with existing details of buildings in the Historic District. He also objected to the design of the roof which caused the new building to overshadow the old building in scale.

Paul noted that the roof design was not similar to any existing building in the Historic District and that the roof lacked any type of overhang which is a prominent feature of buildings within the Historic District. Paul suggested that by eliminating the gable end extensions that jutted out past the ridgeline, Mr. Carroll could lower the overall dominance of the new building. Mr. Carroll did not comment.

Paul Krylowski also objected to the window design and placement. He pointed out that the windows do not match the detail of windows found in the Historic District. Mr. Carroll replied that the overall physical size was the same as in the Bartley House.

Paul Krylowski then questioned the design use of copper clad window boxes protruding from the addition sides. There are no metal clad boxed windows within the district. He also questioned the horizontal division of the exterior finish, half stone and half stucco and the use of barn siding at sporadic points.

Dale Blum said that the design was a compromise between what the church wanted and what the HPC wanted.

Caryl Brackenridge stated that she felt the design met the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Historic Rehabilitation. However, she expressed concern about the possibility of poor quality cultured stone in place of natural stone and asked if HPC could see samples for approval if natural stone was not used. Mr. Carroll stated that he was working with a firm that would look at the local stone buildings and try to duplicate the effect, and that samples could be presented for approval.

Keith Hayes said that he approved of the design and also felt that it met the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Historic Rehabilitation.

Bill Beute stated that the aerial view (Exhibit A5) gives the best idea of how the majority of the construction is set back from the road and his only suggestion was to soften the east elevation with use of windows with divided lights.

Eileen Stokes agreed that the design met the Standards but stated that she also understood Paul Krylowski's concerns. She then introduced **HPC Exhibit B** which showed old pictures of the house and the church. She stated that the new building replicated the rhythm of gable, gable, gable by adding a new gable between the house and the church.

Eileen said that the retention of the Bartley Homestead satisfied Standards 1 and 2 which involve the preservation of historic materials and features. While the new construction of modern materials and size is a drastic change for the area, it is a physical record of its own time which satisfies Standard 3. She said the plan also satisfies Standards 9 and 10 which deal with new additions being differentiated from the old while being compatible with historic materials and features.

Open for Public Comment

There were no comments from the public and Jim Knox stated that the church members had seen the plans and approved. Eileen Stokes declared that the application was deemed complete and the meeting was again closed for public comment. She then asked for a motion.

Caryl Brackenridge made the following motion, seconded by Keith Hayes:
Move to approve a COA (**RO 02-01-08**) for the Zion Lutheran Church project as presented in Exhibits A1-A5 with two stipulations.

1. Substantial changes from the presented plans shall require HPC approval.
2. Samples of stone or cultured stone material shall be presented for HPC approval before construction.

Roll call vote on motion:

Paul Krylowski - No	Caryl Brackenridge - Yes
Bill Beute - Yes	Keith Hayes - Yes
Dale Blum - Yes	Eileen Stokes - Yes

The motion passed by a vote of 5-1.

The public left the room and the regular meeting continued. The HPC discussed the fact that our A level Commissioner Walter Hollien has been unable to attend any meetings during the past year. The consensus was that while he is a valuable source of information and is always available by email for consultation, it is difficult for the HPC not to have a qualified A level Commissioner at the meetings. Eileen requested suggestions for a possible replacement but HPC will continue to seek Walter's advice and help at this time.

Paul Krylowski expressed his disappointment at the HPC approval of the Zion Lutheran church project and left the meeting.

Old Business -CLG grant to review and update the Historic Preservation Ordinance
The grant ends in October 1st and contract for grant has not been received by the town.
Letter from grantor may be enough for township to at least interview people or seek bids.

New Business

The meeting with Morris County on the Middle Valley bridge has been rescheduled for the last week of February. Eileen Stokes and Paul Krylowski will attend.
Barbara Rossi will attend a March 1st workshop at Drew U. entitled "Preservation in Practice."

The next regularly scheduled meeting will be March 19, 2008.

This meeting was adjourned at 10:10 p.m.

Respectfully submitted

Caryl R. Brackenridge, Secretary

